

MEETING	Community Consultative Committee (CCC) - Eden Breakwater Wharf Extension Project		
MEETING NO.	29	DATE	Wednesday, 30 May 2018
LOCATION	The Captain's Table – Eden Fishermen's Club	TIME	6.00pm
ATTENDEES	Jenny Robb, Debbie Meers, Rob Bain, Richard Lamacraft, Robin Arthur, Mike Skitt, Dr Denis Lawrence (via phone), Natalie Godward, Andrew Dooley, Chantel Steele, Greg Thomson, Isaac Smith, Mike Crandell, Simon Wakefield, Peter Mazey, Tony Matthews, Rob Davis, Tomas Rooney, Coral Reynolds		
APOLOGIES	Paul Webster, John Aveyard, Gail Ward, Megan Cleary, Leanne Scott, Graham Stubbs, Kell Dillon, Glenn Vardy		
PREPARED BY	Coral Reynolds		

1. Acknowledgement to Country, welcome and apologies

Simon thanked attendees for coming to the meeting, noted apologies, acknowledged the traditional custodians and peoples of the Country, both land and sea, and paid his respects to Elders past and present.

It was acknowledged that Denis was participating in the meeting via telephone.

2. Actions from previous meeting

Greg to provide a memo to the CCC by 16 May 2018 re Operating Conditions which will include relevant EPA and other information. It was acknowledged that this information had been provided to the CCC.

3. Post approval update

Simon provided a post approval update as follows:

- The monthly Environmental Representative Report continues to be submitted to the Department of Planning and Environment (DP&E).
- The next ER report is due on 7 June 2018.
- EPBC Referral – The effectiveness of the implementation of mitigation measures have been reported to DoEE with no issues identified and no further action.
- No non-conformances have been reported.

Both the ER and Construction Compliance Reports are available on the project website (<https://www.industry.nsw.gov.au/lands/major-projects/infrastructure/eden/approvals-and-documents>).

4. Operational conditions review

Greg discussed the following with attendees:

- A review of problematic Infrastructure Approval Conditions relating to the operation of cruise ships in the Port of Eden and initial consultation with DP&E has commenced.
- An air quality and noise assessment has commenced to review assumptions and remodel air quality and assess potential noise amenity issues relating to the problematic conditions. Compared to what was done in the Environmental Impact Statement (EIS).

- The CCC has been requested to review these conditions and provide comment or any suggested changes. CCC Comments were required by 29 May 2018. Comments will then be submitted to DP&E for their consideration in June 2018.
- In accordance with the recommendation of the additional assessments and consultation with the CCC, a modification to the Infrastructure Approval may be submitted to DP&E to amend the conditions.
- If submitted, public exhibition of the amendments will be required.

Greg thanked the CCC for the submissions received to date. Jenny stated that she agreed with Cruise Eden's submission but didn't have time to prepare a formal submission.

The meeting discussed the following:

- Noise conditions:
 - Deck announcements and music during transit
 - Upgraded generators/engines/exhausts

Mike S stated that the amendments weren't onerous and noted the content of the submissions that were received on 29 May. Mike S noted his objection was related to music being able to be played on deck and that "music from open decks" should be deleted from any amendments. Mike S felt it was unreasonable to compare Eden to White Bay as White Bay has numerous cruises and would operate under different conditions i.e. departures/sail aways are very noisy. Mike S stated that cruise ships should be able to have music playing if they wanted to for example during the lunchtime period and that the onus is on individual companies to not create any angst in the port communities they visit as it is a multibillion dollar industry. Mike S noted that other activities in the port of Eden are just as noisy.

Denis stated that he was in disagreement with the previous comments and that whilst the majority of cruise ships do adhere to port user requirements and regulations there are some operators who do not. Denis advised that constant trivial announcements are very disruptive. Denis noted that some of the houses adjacent to the port predate the current Breakwater Wharf and when some people bought their houses it was a fishing port that wasn't busy and that these are fairly quiet operations. Denis believed that Eden could be compared to White Bay and that in his experience some companies are good corporate citizens whilst there are others who are serial offenders and sanctions would be required for these operators to adhere to port Operating Conditions. Denis advised that he supports the current Operating Conditions and that modifying these conditions will impact on the quality of life for sensitive receivers.

Robin stated that from his experience that fewer deck announcements are more effective and that it is important to keep these to a minimum, however, some announcements will still be necessary.

Natalie noted that cruise ships currently make announcements as they enter Twofold Bay and as Eden is a transitional port there are fewer deck announcements made compared to other ports, however, some announcements will still be required. Denis noted that sometimes there are ships visiting Eden that make numerous announcements. Mike S stated that tankers had previously come into Eden and had made more deck announcements than cruise ships would.

Greg asked the CCC to submit their recommendations on what is considered "in transit".

- Complaints handling:
 - Process of receiving a complaint, investigating the source, corrective action, reporting and disciplinary action

Greg noted that the current conditions are poorly worded and doesn't allow for a proper investigation into the complaint received. Greg asked the CCC what they thought would be the best method to manage complaints and that there would be more consultation with the CCC before submission to the DP&E.

- Air quality conditions:
 - Low sulphur fuels 0.1% or 0.5% or 2.7% for the 10 month period prior to 1 Jan 2020
 - Low sulphur fuels 0.1% or 0.5% from 1 Jan 2020 onwards.

Greg discussed the requirements for the 10 month period from operation and prior to 1 January 2020 and after 1 January 2020 when the global limit commences. Greg noted that there are issues to be worked out with the Operator. For example if cruise ships have to use 0.5% fuel they will need to bunker this fuel in addition to 2.7% and 0.1% as it is not currently being used at any other port or whilst in transit, this will be very restrictive and could deter ships from visiting Eden. Greg advised that a lot of information will become available from the additional air quality modelling that is currently being undertaken and Natalie advised that in the 10 month period (from operation until 1 January 2020) there will be nine ships that will visit Eden.

Greg noted the submissions that were received discussed noise and air quality conditions. Natalie stated that Sydney is the only place where 0.1% is being used and that there are no ships carrying 0.5% and the best case scenario is to allow bunker fuel (2.7%) to be used until 2020. For a cruise ship this will be a minimum of \$25K in additional costs per visit and that no cruise ship operators would come to Eden. Debbie stated that she had been at Cruise Eden since 2005 and that in some seasons the port had no cruise ship visits and it had been difficult to rebuild the number of cruise ships coming to Eden and any unnecessary restrictions will undo all the hard work. Natalie stated that when cruise ships were in White Bay and burning fuel no air quality levels were exceeded.

Robin stated that some of the statistics regarding fuel emissions were horrific (ie 1 cruise ship = 1 million cars), stakeholder concerns shouldn't be disregarded and the port shouldn't succumb to any threats from the cruise industry to withdraw ships coming to Eden. Robin noted there had been worldwide pressure to reduce emissions and that Eden should anticipate this and speak with other ports. Natalie confirmed that she is in contact with other ports and that Cruise Eden is a member of the Australian Cruise Association, of which every port in Australia is a member of.

Simon and Mike C noted that additional modelling of the assumptions made in the EIS is currently being undertaken which will quantify emission levels. Natalie advised that air quality would be monitored and that the Port Authority would be installing air monitoring equipment. Robin noted that this will address his concerns. Jenny noted that there are a lot of different variables in White Bay which impact air quality levels such as heavy vehicles and the high number of shipping movements. Greg discussed the change in legislation from the NSW EPA to the Commonwealth.

Simon asked CCC members to submit any of their comments to Coral. Andrew advised that this step is just the beginning of consultation with the CCC.

Mike S believed that there should be an economic, environmental and social balance and that some of the submissions weren't considering any economic factors.

5. Marine structures update – May 2018

Greg provided an update of Stage 2 marine structures as follows:

- Offsite works related to the fabrication of the dolphin topside is ongoing
- The Bhagwan Challenge arrived on site on 7 May and piling commenced for the onshore bollards
- Pile installation is continuing with 18 piles completed to date
- Piles are being stored at the Navy Wharf and brought over to the project site.
- 47 of 252 deck planks have been poured.
- Forecast contract completion date remains as February 2019.

6. Environmental monitoring update – May 2018

Greg provided an update of environmental monitoring as follows:

- Water quality:
 - No complaints or adverse water quality observations were received regarding water quality levels in Snug Cove.
- Noise levels:
 - No noise complaints were received.
- Marine mammals:
 - No incidents involving marine mammals.
 - Whales were sighted within the piling observation area on Friday 25 May .
 - Piling was delayed until the whales had cleared the area – this wasn't a requirement but was undertaken.
- Noise and Vibration Monitoring:
 - Monitoring was ongoing throughout the month of May. No issues were recorded with either noise or vibration levels.
 - Vibration monitoring has now ceased, having captured levels for the closest piling works. The report should be received shortly.
 - Noise monitoring will remain in place for the duration of the project.
 - Noise levels are checked by the site team daily to ensure compliance with approvals.

Denis stated that for members of the CCC who don't reside in Snug Cove they are unable to hear the piling and that it was like hitting a steel fence pile with a sledgehammer within a house. Denis advised that while no noise complaints had been received or issues registered in May, piling is imposing a significant impact and loss of amenity for residents. Denis noted that this was not a criticism directed at Waterway Constructions. Mike S noted that whilst the noise levels have been significant the work undertaken to date has been very intermittent.

7. Community complaints – May 2018

Attendees were advised that no community complaints were received during the month.

8. Community feedback

Simon asked the CCC if they had any feedback to provide the project team. Jenny thanked Waterway Constructions for sponsoring the Chamber of Commerce Business Awards.

The meeting closed at 6.51pm.